The Dissonance of Heritage

Jemaa el-fna Square Marrakech, Morocco

Ouafae Akhchine
Abstract

Cultural heritage has altered content significantly in recent decades, partly due to the methods developed by UNESCO; it does not cease at archive, library, and museum. It also includes living expressions inherited from our ancestors and passed on to our descendants, such as oral traditions, performing arts, social practices, or traditional crafts knowledge; called intangible cultural heritage (UNESCO, 2021).

Jemaa el-fna square inscribed in 2008 on the Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity (originally proclaimed in 2001) (UNESCO, 2022). The purpose of this paper is to assess the different layers of periods at the ‘‘heritage’’, focusing on the dissonance of the site, to understand how the initial role of Jemaa el-fna square as a place of pain and shame is remembered.

The empirical findings indicate that dissonant heritage can be a significant communication means not merely to remember the past, yet to serve as a reminder for the present and a caution for the future. The case of Jemaa el-fna square, the heritage place as lieux de mémoire (Nora, 1989) illustrates participatory memory; how the respondents memorialize, celebrate, and draw reflections around the physical space of the heritage site. Which can be of use to Communication for Development, particularly in post-conflict contexts.

**Key words:** Dissonance, heritage, memory, Jemaa el-fna square, Media, Communication for development.
Acknowledgement

I further acknowledge my sincere gratitude to my supervisor Tobias Denskus for his encouragement and positive mindset and the enthusiasm he used in assessing and following up on this study. I also would like to thank the professors and lecturers who I have come across during the Communication for Development MA program for their valuable input and feedback. I am also grateful to all scholars whose works and writings were of significant asset to this research along with the professionals and experts outside academia.

I also extend a special gratitude to my family for their continuous support and motivation especially my father who flew from Morocco to Sweden during turbulent time to express dad’s supportive presence. My Dear Father, I could not pull this off without You.
# Table of Contents

Abstract

1. **Introduction**
   - 1.1. Background and Rationale of the Study
   - 1.2. Research Question and Purpose
   - 1.3. Chapter Structure
   - 1.4. Limitations

2. **Literature Review**
   - 2.1. The Phenomenon of Memory
   - 2.2. Official Heritage-Intangible Heritage Site
   - 2.3. Dissonant Heritage
   - 2.4. Heritage and Media Studies
   - 2.5. Communication for Development and Social Change

3. **Theoretical/Conceptual Framework**

4. **Methodology**
   - 4.1. Methodological Approaches
   - 4.2. Case Selection and Data Collection
   - 4.3. Research Validity and Reliability
   - 4.4. Implications and Ethics

5. **Empirical Findings and Analysis**

6. **Conclusion**

References

Appendices
1. Introduction

1.1. Background and Rational of the Study

As a student at Communication for Development (ComDev) Master program and because of personal background, originating from Morocco, I wished that the subject of my degree project would bring together both my interest for ComDev and personal experience. In March 2022, we had a module called Culture and Media Analysis that focuses on textual analysis of media representations and practices, inside an outside organization communicating social change and development. The module coordinator and professor Anders Høg Hansen called for an opportunity to participate with a presentation/case study exploring cultural heritage. I approached the module coordinator and expressed my interested to take part in the heritage seminar. Eventually, I and six other classmates volunteered to participate in the Heritage seminar that took place on May 05\textsuperscript{th} 2022. The seminar explored popular and institutional cultural heritage with case studies from various continents, Africa, Europe, North America, and Asia.

Before contacting the module coordinator, I was hesitant about the heritage case study. What to present? What to choose? It coincided, that I had recently came from Morocco where I spent the summer vacation in Marrakesh at my sister’s place and made frequent visits to Jemaa el-fna square. This visit was different in many aspects. The last time I was there, I was a teenager, a student at secondary school, and accompanied by my parents. While this time, I was an adult, a professional and a mother. Hence, my perspective and perception about Jemaa el-fna square has changed.

Therefore, I chose Jemaa el-fna square in Marrakesh, Morocco as a cultural heritage site. My focus will be on how a heritage “place” has changed and transformed usage and meaning overtime and also where contemporary vibrant community and cultural heritage is being produced.

We, the presenters discussed and highlighted the interpretations of the past, present and future that are conveyed in the heritage cases. Alongside, we received constructive feedback to develop the work further in the CMA module essay assignment in late May 2022 which opened my perspective and could eventually enhance the heritage case. Though, I was challenged to reduce the scope of the research and focused on only two-three inputs due to the word limitation.

My interest in cultural heritage continued. During the Research Method module, we had to write a research method essay which described in detail a methodological approach to an imaginary
study to be submitted in January 2023. Once again, I chose the heritage site Jemaa el-fna square as the topic of the imagined DP project.

The ComDev program ended with an individual degree project. I once more, decided to write about the heritage site Jemaa el-fna square. It seems that a set of subsequent events led me to dive deep into cultural heritage, my personal process of continuing exploration and growth within writing. Nonetheless, the path was challenging, and I encountered certain obstacles which will be discussed further in the Limitations section. For the time being, I would like to embark the reader on the write journey of Dissonance Heritage, Jemaa el-fna Square Marrakesh, Morocco.

1.2. Research Question

According to Smith (2006, p.2) “The real sense of heritage, the real moment of heritage then our emotions and sense of self are truly engaged, it is not so much in the possession of the necklace, but in the act of passing on and receiving memories and knowledge”. Within this context, heritage places are commonly lieu de mémoire, acting, as Nora (1989) suggested, as sites harboring memories that serve to maintain a group’s sense of connection with its roots in the past. Indeed, sometimes sites gradually change as memories of the past fade or are distorted (Logan and Reeves, 2009). Hence, the question arises on how to bring together different layers of heritage, interpretations, and meanings, which become memorial?

According to Hansen, Hemer, and Tufte (2014) memorials and monuments can be important tools to keep the past alive. Deciding which memories get prominence is contentious. State and civic influences weigh in, and debates in the public sphere challenge or sanction certain memories and memorial forms. In the same regard, several academics view memory as having a key role in social transition because it can construct meaningful narratives about the past for the present (Assmann and Shortt, 2012). In addition, the scholar Thomas Tufte depicts memory work as a ‘hidden resource’ in communicating for social change. This type of action in the present can help shape the future, ideas of a better future (Hansen, Hemer, and Tufte, 2014). Last, how societies remember is an essential issue for their development, meant here in the broadest sense of the term (Hansen, Hemer, and Tufte, 2014).

Let me start this exploration by defining some of the main concepts here, especially the concepts of memory, cultural heritage, and dissonance. Of these terms, “memory” is the one that appear to
hold several opinions. Although I recognize that there are some new definitions of memory that are accepted in neuroscience yet not obviously stated, I take Pierre Nora’s words “Lieux de memoire originate with the sense that there is no spontaneous memory, that we must deliberately create archives, maintain anniversaries, organize celebrations, pronounce eulogies, and notarize bills because such activities no longer occur naturally (Nora, 1989).

Even though, I correspondingly acknowledge that there are settings where a differentiation between tangible and intangible cultural heritage is significant; I consider the UNESCO Institute for Statistics definition “Cultural heritage includes artefacts, monuments, a group of buildings and sites, museums that have a diversity of values including symbolic, historic, artistic, aesthetic, ethnological or anthropological, scientific and social significance. It includes tangible heritage (movable, immobile and underwater), intangible cultural heritage (ICH) embedded into cultural, and natural heritage artefacts, sites, or monuments. The definition excludes ICH related to other cultural domains such as festivals, celebration etc. It covers industrial heritage and cave paintings” (UIS, 2009).

While the term “dissonance” is frequently mentioned in music theory, explaining that two tones do not blend into one another harmonically, however builds a certain tension (MasterClass, 2021). The mix of these tones can sound harsh and unpleasant. Back to the academic scene, the concept of dissonant heritage was introduced by Turnbridge and Ashworth (1996), referring to heritages that include a discordance of different stories and a lack of agreement and consistency in the way the past is represented and memories used in public spheres. That is to say, the interpretation of cultural heritage is deemed dissonant when distinct groups assign several stories to a particular object or site. The latter definition will be used throughout this paper.

It is worthwhile to define the term “media” in a heritage setting for this chapter. Media is the reflection of society that communicates information to the public sphere. Earlier, it was traditional media including print media (newspapers, magazines, and books) and broadcast media (radio and television). Today, it is digital media or what is called the new media. I.e., information that shared electronically via a digital device or screen such as social media, podcast, blog, e-books, digital photographs, websites, mobile phones applications…etc. The key characteristics of traditional media is one way communication, where information travels from the sender to the receiver with no feedback. This contrasts with the new media, which features two-ways communication
allowing recipients to provide feedback to the sender and be involved. Facebook, Instagram, and Tweeter are examples of interactive social media content. Then, beginning in the late nineteenth century, electric media began to more rapidly and widely disseminate information for and about archaeology (particularly the more spectacular finds) first through telegraphs and telephones, then in the twentieth century through movies, radio, and television, and, most recently, through the computer and the Internet (Eck, 2013).

1.3. Chapter Structure

The paper at hand is structured into different chapters. The introduction chapter explains the background and rationale of the study, underlines the context to the chosen heritage site as a case study, and defines the research purpose and research question. The following chapter is dedicated to the literature review, which further defines and elaborates on the concepts of memory, cultural heritage, dissonance, and media studies. Next, an overview of the theoretical and conceptual framework is developed based on the literature review and the research purpose. Plus, the selected research methodology and the research design is presented. The following chapter analyses the data collected about the site Jemaa el-fna square and examines the study main findings. Last, the conclusion chapter summarizes the main findings, and steps moving forward.

1.4. Limitations

While writing this paper, the author had the opportunity to learn more about cultural heritage, memory, and dissonance. And how states and international organizations are working to preserve the heritage site and generate public awareness.

The author faced certain challenges such as: going through the rich literature about cultural heritage and filtering the relevant scientific references, books, and gray literature which took some time. Furthermore, is the limited sample size of interviews. It was not feasible to take a larger sample of respondents due to time constraints and availability of the respondents. 12 interviews were conducted, which can be considered few to draw conclusions from.

Research limitations from this study also exist in that the study focuses on Jemaa el-fna square, which might differ from other heritage sites in Europe, Asia, or America, where cultural heritage
is investigated. There is ample evidence that other, and thus, the extent to which finding from this study can be generalized.

2. Literature Review

2.1. The Phenomenon of Memory

The interdisciplinary field of memory studies is emerging. “Past continuity in the Present” has been highlighted in the work of various researchers such as Maurice Halbwach’s (1992) collective memory, Pierre Nora’s (1989) lieux de memoire, Jan Assmann’s (2011) cultural memory, not to mention other scholars (Hansen, 2008; Garde-Hansen, 2011; and Erll, 2009).

According to Nora (1989) memory is life, borne by living societies founded in its name. It remains in permanent evolution, open to the dialectic of remembering and forgetting, unconscious of its successive deformations, vulnerable to manipulation and appropriation, susceptible to being long dormant and periodically revived. In the same context, the philosopher and the sociologist Halbwachs (1992) described personal memory coming from daily life - people learn to ‘remember’ the past based on stories and rituals passed along from the many groups they belong to; family, community, and work place. Hence, memory is a connection that binds people to the infinite present. And it is established in actions, pictures, objects, and the tangible. While Nikulin (2015) touches upon the Freudian unconscious, which refers to a repressed fund of wishes, memories, and images, often arising in infancy, and which can erupt in such forms as dreams, jokes, slips of the tongue, and neurotic symptoms. This means, past residues of memory were present in the mind from the start.

The scholar Jan Assmann (2011) defines memory as “collectively shared knowledge” that gives groups a sense of unity and heritage. Memory, as the basis of human history and culture, can never be only individual, but must be collective. Hence, the notion of memory is social conditioning. The most important element of collective cultural memory in any ancient society is the myth (Zhdanov, 2021). A myth is always a narrative or a story with a pronounced ideological orientation. In fact, due to myth early man attempted to answer the fundamental philosophical questions of existence such as: Where did we come from? Why are we here? Is there an afterlife? and so on. According to Assmann, the myth in any ancient culture always performs two functions. First, justifying”. It consists in justifying the events of the present time with the help of a story about the
events of the distant past, which resulted in the current state of the world and human society. I.e., myth is a kind of symbolic storytelling that was not grounded on facts. Second, is the "contrasting" function of myth (Zhdanov, 2021). In other words, the myth contrasts the past from one side and the present/future from the other side. In short, the past in myth is the Golden age.

However, who decides upon memory ideas and norms? “On the basis of its cultural heritage and traditions, a society is recognisable: for itself as well as for others. What kind of past and what identification values a society shows to good advantage indicate its character and in which direction it wants to be heading” (Assmann, 2011).

2.2. Official Heritage-Intangible Heritage Site

Heritage is a vehicle of communication, a means of transmission of ideas, values and knowledge, which includes the tangibles and intangibles of both cultural and natural heritage (Ashworth, 2007). These ‘ideas, values and knowledge’ have been constructed through the relationships of individuals and groups. In addition, Hall (1997) states that the ideas and values of local, ethnic, religious or other communities, and their knowledge, have been ascribed or developed over time, although these meanings and values may – and do – change. Actually, specific aspects of cultural heritage can become insignificant (Harrison, 2012). The latter can be determined by how heritage is transformed and administered currently and utilized as an asset in the future throughout memories that are passed on from generation to generation.

The engagement with the heritage site has been through an official lens. The idea of “official heritage” has been shaped by Smith’s (2006) analysis of the Authorized Heritage Discourse; Whereas Harrison (2012) indicates that “Official heritage” is often used by governments and cultural institutions to cultivate a sense of national or cosmopolitan identity around some aspect of the past. Compared with the “top-down” nature of “official heritage”, “unofficial heritage” is characterized by the “bottom-up” ways in which individuals sort out their relationship to, and uses of, the past, which may be in tension with, or at least unrecognized by, official characterizations of heritage (Harrison, 2010). Such as local festivals that are of no interest to the state.

While the cultural heritage started with a concentrate on material objects, it has grown, as a response to rising recognition of different cultures, involving stories, songs, and traditional skills.
These additional elements, referred to as ‘intangible heritage’ (Brown, 2005). In fact, the significance of intangible cultural heritage is not the cultural manifestation itself but the knowledge that is communicated through it from one generation to the other. The social and economic value of this transmission of knowledge is relevant for minorities and for mainstream social groups and is as important for developing States as for developed ones (UNESCO, 2001).

2.3. Dissonant Heritage

Official heritage tends to be associated with positive evaluations of the past (Harrison, 2012), although not internationally so (Smith, 2006). In fact, the word ‘heritage’ in many languages has an overwhelmingly positive public connotation” (Macdonald, 2010). Which makes the identification of places of pain and shame as heritage a sensitive topic; referred to as difficult or dissonant heritage. Thus, debate arises about how to reconcile the positive associations of the heritage concept with sites that people experience as traumatic (Meskell 2002; Macdonald 2010; Tunbridge and Ashworth 1996). Logan and Reeves (2009) refer to dissonant heritage as “…massacre and genocide sites, places related to prisoners of war, civil and political prisons, and places of ‘benevolent’ internment. These sites bring shame upon us now for the cruelty and futility of the events that occurred within them and the ideologies they represented. They are however increasingly being regarded as heritage sites”.

In the world’s rapidly changing cultural contexts, dissonant heritage can be transformed to adapt to the realities of the world in which we live. Specifically, the transformation manifests in changes in understanding the word “heritage”, changes in instruments to safeguard heritage, and changes in the heritage functions. The latter will be analyzed in the coming sections using the example of Jemaa el-fna square.

Assmann (2011) outlined various forms of forgetting such as: automatic, preservative, and selective forgetting (morally neutral forms). The latter can be compared to computer memory space. “While storage space can be infinitely extended and supplemented, memory space remains a rare resource,” Assmann (2011) said. “Our brains will have to go on working on the more or less limited and invariant basis of their biological infrastructure.”. Besides, forgetting unpleasant and painful memories can lessen in intensity with time and using certain strategies can aid in coping with the past and in the transformation process. Also in this context, Erll and Rigney (2009) explain that ‘cultural memory is an ongoing process of remembrance and forgetting in which individuals
and groups continue to reconfigure their relationship to the past and hence reposition themselves in relation to established and emergent memory sites. Similarly, heritage is also an ongoing process as Smith (2006) has demonstrated; the construction, reconstruction, even destruction of heritage and material culture is part of the transformation, development and therefore overall process of heritage.

2.4. Heritage and Media Studies

In the same vein, capturing the past is becoming increasingly sophisticated and memory tools such as television, film, photocopies, digital archives, photographic albums, scanners, mobile phones and social network sites aid in remembering (Hansen, 2011, p.26). Similarly using media to depict the past via documentaries, history channels, Hollywood movies, and Netflix series appear to be bizarre with watching live tv footage of events such as the fall of the Berlin Wall or the 11 September attack.

We understand the past (our own, our family’s, our country’s, our world’s) through media discourses, forms, technologies and practices. Our understanding of our nation’s or community’s past is intimately connected to our life histories. Therefore, mediated accounts of wars, assasinations, genocides and terrorist attacks intermingle in our minds with multimedia national/local museum exhibits and heritage sites, community history projects, oral histories, family photo albums, even tribute bands, advertisement jingles and favourite TV shows from childhood (Hansen, 2011). In fact, Marshall McLuhan (1994) would argue that media are extensions of memory. It is our need to remember and share everything and the limitations of doing this mentally as individuals that drives human beings to extend our capacity for remembering through media forms and practices. As a matter of fact, it is not only about mediating the past and how do we relate to it. It is more about recognizing the legacy we leave behind for the future generations and how to use media to communicate our own histories, our heritage.

‘Heritage is our legacy from the past, what we live with today, and what we pass on to future generations. Our cultural and natural heritage are both irreplaceable sources of life and inspiration’ (UNESCO, 2023a).

Throughout the years UNESCO has been working to identify, safeguard and preserve cultural heritage worldwide that has notable value. This is embodied in The World Heritage Convention

On a different note, the ways in which heritage reconstruction and destruction can be problematic for communities unless the communities themselves actively decide on – and engage with – these processes, from a bottom-up perspective (Apaydin, 2020).

There are various ways to create awareness on heritage preservation. Using media can generate an interest in the public and the concerned parties. Since the development of archeology, the media played a role starting from the publication of books, reporting of archeological discoveries by media outlets till presentation of archeology in different visual arts.

The role of the media in preserving cultural heritage can be defined as the use of the full range of journalistic, artistic, print, electronic, and broadcast mass communications to inform the professional archaeological community and the general public on the many methods, activities, and plans for encouraging the understanding, protection, conservation, and documentation of the world’s archaeological, historical, artistic, and cultural patrimony for the present and future generations (Eck, 2020). In fact, the media has both national and international responsibility, especially in countries that engage in a comprehensive struggle against new colonialism to preserve and promote the components of the national memory, especially the cultural and civilizational heritage (Darwish, 2019). In short, media takes part in defining and preserving the cultural heritage and strengthens its elements in society. These elements are Fabric, Culture, and Stories. One or all of these things make up the historic heritage of a place (DOC, 2023).

2.5. Communication for Development and Social Change

Storytelling

Stories describe and explain our history - they are what you read, hear or watch. Stories can be told in many different ways. They tell us what happened in the past, the people involved, what events took place and why (DOC, 2023). Storytelling is an oral tradition that dates to ancient age and has been practiced by many cultures in different time eras. According to National Geographic (2023) oral storytelling is telling a story through voice and gestures. The oral tradition can take many forms, including epic poems, chants, rhymes, songs, and more. Not all of these stories are historically accurate or even true. Truth is less important than providing cultural cohesion. It can encompass myths, legends, fables, religion, prayers, proverbs, and instructions.
There are many definitions and meanings of storytelling. According to the National Storytelling Network, storytelling is defined as an ancient art form and a valuable form of human expression. What the majority of people mean by storytelling (Storynet, 2023):

“Storytelling is the interactive art of using words and actions to reveal the elements and images of a story while encouraging the listener’s imagination.”

The importance of storytelling for the transmission of information is acknowledged by several scholars across different disciplinary fields. Psychologists, such as Bruner (1991), claim that stories provide a framework for making sense of events and convey the values of a culture. Communication specialists, such as Gershon and Page (2001), claim that stories can convey large amounts of information in a compact format, easily assimilated by the user. This means that storytelling has educational and informative purposes. To illustrate this, in Western Africa, the practice of storytelling is heavily present as the village gathers around a central fire to listen to the storyteller. Long part of western African culture are the griots: storytellers, troubadours, and counsellors to kings. They perform the functions of storyteller, genealogist, historian, ambassador, and more. There are also griot schools, where more formal training can be had and both men and women can take up the profession. Some of the most famous stories from western Africa are those of Anansi, the trickster spider (NationalGeaographic, 2023).

Storytelling emerged and evolved from visual stories (e.g., cave drawings), to oral traditions, to narratives, to media (images, videos, recordings, blogs, social media platforms…etc). To sum up, the role of storytelling is to entertain and educate, to pass down cultural traditions. Also, a social and cultural practice that contributes to the tourism and development of the region. As stated by Solomon, Adu-Debrah, and Braimah (2022) “As a performing narrative, storytelling is an effective communication strategy in cultural and heritage tourism”.

**Development**

Cultural heritage tourism or heritage tourism is when tourists choose a travel destination mainly to explore the history and heritage of the place. That is why, various nations work seriously to get their wilderness areas, archaeological treasures, and cultural sites on the World Heritage list, which includes some 1,157 properties around the world (UNESCO, 2023b). Inscription brings prestige and public awareness, and it can lead to all sorts of good things: tourism revenue, renewed
commitments to preserve irreplaceable assets, and public and private funding for restoration work (National Geographic, 2021). This means, cultural heritage can foster development and social change.

In fact, even archaeological sites that were constructed thousands of years ago still play a role in the social and everyday life of groups and communities. The case of the UNESCO world heritage site of Catalhoyuk in Turkey is a good example of an instance where heritage unrelated to modern-day inhabitants still has a strong impact. Although local communities did not have a relation to the site related to their identity construction, it was still significant for them. Local communities have been engaging in their daily activities for generations there, using the site for economic income among other activities (Apaydin, 2020). I.e., the site has a vital role in everyday life.

Development is used to illustrate improvements in the lives of people. Its definition varies across a number of disciplines such as: government, international relations, economic, and social. A well-known perspective on development is an economic one that considers growth in levels of income generated by individuals, businesses or multi-national organizations, countries, and regions (Qureshi, 2019). Another lens used to recognize improvements in the lives of people is social development. The social development perspective enables a broader understanding of development to be achieved through top-down national policy-making processes as well as bottom-up (Qureshi, 2019). Indeed, social development activities are intended to improve living standards and quality of life, empower, and involve locals in development and decision making and tackle the needs of vulnerable communities.

Such uses create an opportunity for heritage sites to survive for generations, allowing memory and heritage to accumulate for the future, but in a way that can adapt and transform themselves to the requirements of today’s world (Apaydin, 2020). As the above example of the site Catalhoyuk in Turkey that depicts the evolution from settled villages to urban agglomeration. On a similar note, Sather-Wagstaff (2015) suggests that heritage cannot exist without continuous performance and active engagement of people within everyday life.
3. Theoretical/Conceptual Framework

Taking into account the theory presented in the literature review and the research purpose, the below theoretical/conceptual framework is developed (figure 1):

Figure 1: Theoretical/Conceptual Framework

**Heritage** and cultural properties in all its forms represent the collective **memory** of peoples, which are passed down from one generation to the next, combined with national characteristics and distinctive national characteristics. Moreover, the effects constitute a cycle of cultural and civilizational development (Darwish, 2019).

This is how my framework helped me to analyse. First, heritage represents the collective memory of people. Furthermore, heritage **dissonance** is the identification of the heritage site as a ‘’Place’’ of pain and shame. During the process of **remembrance and forgetting** (Assmann, 2011), the dissonant heritage can be transformed to adapt to the changes in today’s world. In addition, **media** is a tool to depict the past either using traditional media or the new media. Hence, understanding our history, our ancestors and preserving the cultural heritage. In line with this thinking, the use of storytelling practice as an oral tradition to inform, entertain and educate.
To conclude, cultural heritage can bring various benefits on different levels whether economic, social, government…etc. As a result, cultural heritage can promote development and social change. To sum up, the relationship between memory and cultural heritage is that they mutually aid to understand culture, preserve and transfer values and knowledge to the next generations.

4. Methodology
   4.1. Methodological Approach

The author uses qualitative method, where the data is largely in textual form analyzed using qualitative data analysis techniques (Cameron and Molina-Azorin, 2011). Hence, this method is appropriate to the study since it deals with words instead of numbers as an interpretative method to decode how a dissonant heritage site has changed meaning and usage overtime. The below methods are used:

Textual Analysis

This qualitative method was chosen to examine how memorials make us remember and forget, the meaning of memorials, and how meaning/usage is being re-produced and the potential interpretations. Texts about heritage site are polysemic—have multiple and varied meanings; that is derived from the codes, conventions, and genre of the text and its social, cultural, historical, and ideological context—which can work together to convey a preferred reading of the text (Lockyer, 2008).

Being a Moroccan can strengthen this study since many of the texts are either in Arabic, Amazigh, or French—Morocco’s official languages. Also, by knowing the local culture, the author tried to create a safe and welcoming environment to make the respondents comfortable during the interview. And eventually, open to share their thoughts and experiences. Hence, developing communications with the respondents and building trusting relationships that go beyond the study at hand. Besides, developing the author’s research and future work. Nevertheless, the author runs the risk of reading and interpreting the texts through their lenses (Saukko, 2003). For instance, texts about the heritage site can echoes the perspective of the author—remembering it as a place of joy instead of place of pain and shame.

Interviewing
According to Lockyer (2008) combining textual analysis with further methods prevents the risk of textualizing the world—perceiving the world specifically in terms of texts—and acknowledges the world that exists outside of texts. Therefore, focus groups and individual interviews are used.

a. **Focus Groups**

The focus groups would typically provide access to a greater number of participants (Morgan, 2008) and explore their various perspectives and experiences. The author intends to start with focus groups and later utilize the broad themes that were produced in group to narrow in and explore more profoundly one-to-one interview. Implementing this strategy allows the author to identify respondents who seem to be "typical cases" or to select respondents with more bizarre experiences to expand the coverage of the study (Mishler, 1991; Morgan, 1996). Simply, to follow up by interviewing respondents that can be of great use to advance the study.

b. **Individual Interviews**

Interviews are used to gain an in-depth understanding of perception about Jemaa el-fna square. The respondents are targeted using a combination of demographics, geographics, psychographics and behaviors criteria who fit the research. The respondents can be heritage experts, local government employees, scholars journalists, artists, international tourists, and local citizens. Coghlan and Brydon-Miller (2014) emphasizes the importance of local research to develop understandings of our lives and interconnections. Besides, it promotes the wellbeing and development of local communities.

The author used her contacts in Morocco and abroad, explained the purpose of the study and asked for a potential interview. Also, the author’s family have supported with finding various respondents who were willing to take part in the study. Eventually, one contact led to an another and a total of 12 interviews were secured. Yet, there were some persons who declined the interview due to the work obligations and response bias (providing inaccurate answers since they have not visited Jemaa el-fna for many years). The respondents are approached either via email, telephone or in person and asked to take part in the study. The author aims to have face-to-face interview when feasible. If not, via Zoom, in which the author has full access account thanks to Malmö University.
4.2. Case Selection and Data Collection

To increase internal validity of the study, case study will be used. According to Blatter (2008) case studies can use more and more diverse indicators for representing a theoretical concept and for securing the internal validity of causal inferences and/or theoretical interpretations for these cases. The Jemaa el-fna square is one of the main cultural spaces in Marrakech and has become one of the symbols of the city since its foundation in the eleventh century. It represents popular Moroccan cultural traditions performed through musical, religious, and artistic expressions (UNESCO, 2022). Growing up in Morocco, the author got familiar with the heritage site and has been there many occasions; as child, teenager, adult, and during covid-19.

Jemaa el-fna square (figure 1) is one of the main cultural spaces in Marrakech and has become one of the symbols of the city since its foundation in the eleventh century. It represents popular Moroccan cultural traditions performed through musical, religious, and artistic expressions (UNESCO, 2022). Juan Goytisolo, the Spanish writer who lived in a house across the Jema el-fna square campaigned successfully for the site to be declared a UNESCO masterpiece of oral heritage (The Guardian, 2017). Schmitt (2008) states that Jemaa el-fna square was already relatively well known, it appeared in literary works, as Juan Goytisolo’s novel Makbara (1980) or the earlier Voices of Marrakesh by Elias Canetti (1954).

Figure 1: Jemaa el-fna square (2022)
Fieldwork to Marrakech, Morocco
The fieldwork trip took place between Monday 3\textsuperscript{rd} July 2023 and Monday 17\textsuperscript{th} July 2023 in Marrakech. Where the researcher was staying with her sister not far from the site Jemaa el-fna square. During this period the researcher had the opportunity to observe the passersby, locals and tourists, the sellers, the street artists, and the performances. Conduct further interviews met some of the respondents in person. Significantly, the researcher got to know the respondents, exchange ideas, share stories which builds inclusion, improves communication, and increases the respondent’s engagement. Along the way, the researcher documented the research paper to recognize the underlying design for the research output. The tools utilized included taking pictures, creating videos, using audio recordings, writing comments and reflections, and transcribing the recordings.

Interview Details
Interviews aim to provide original and first-hand information to the study. Twelve interviews were conducted. Certain respondents needed more time since they have more knowledge and experience. Indeed, these respondents were comfortable to provide deep and reflective responses to the interview questions. Some interviews were done virtual while others face to face. The below table provides detailed information about the interviews; every respondent is given a code, e.g., Respondent 1=R1. Besides, the date, role, seniority level, and residence are indicated.

The interviews are semi-structured, which gives the author the possibility to ask unplanned questions that arise during the interview conversation. Other communication channels were also used for further requests including email, telephone, and WhatsApp.

The interview questionnaire used in the data collection is stored in Appendix I. The questionnaire was created applying five steps:

1. Identifying the study purpose (the dissonance of heritage)
2. Choosing the question type (open-ended questions)
3. Making questions (clear, concise, direct)
4. Identify the target population (locals and tourists)
5. Protecting privacy (anonymous respondents)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Seniority Level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>R 1</td>
<td>230418</td>
<td>Sales Representative in Medical Tourism</td>
<td>Aspirant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R 2</td>
<td>230418</td>
<td>Marketing &amp; Commercial Intern</td>
<td>Aspirant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R 3</td>
<td>230424</td>
<td>Customer Advisor</td>
<td>In the Role</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R 4</td>
<td>230424</td>
<td>Senior Manager &amp; Learning Expert</td>
<td>Senior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R 5</td>
<td>230424</td>
<td>Self Employed, Artisanal Products</td>
<td>Senior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R 6</td>
<td>230427</td>
<td>Software Engineer</td>
<td>In the Role</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R 7</td>
<td>230428</td>
<td>Senior Marketing Associate</td>
<td>Senior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R 8</td>
<td>230707</td>
<td>Tourist Guide</td>
<td>In the Role</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R 9</td>
<td>230705</td>
<td>Retiree. Chief of Police Station</td>
<td>Senior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R 10</td>
<td>230430</td>
<td>IT, Network Security</td>
<td>Senior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R 11</td>
<td>230501</td>
<td>Retiree. Technical Project Assistant/WHO</td>
<td>Senior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R 12</td>
<td>230706</td>
<td>Librarian</td>
<td>In the Role</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Interview Details- Aspirant: entry-level, in the Role: mid-level, Senior: senior-level

**Analysis Method**

After transcribing the interviews, the collected data was stored and analyzed taking into consideration the secondary data retrieved from scientific articles, books, and websites. The author grouped the respondents’ answers into four categories considering the literature review and empirics; instead of utilizing a table that lists the interview questions and answers. Hence, increasing the efficiency of the process since the author used semi-structured interviews. Indeed, having the interview answers constructed into categories will enable the reader to have a better understanding about the respondent’s experience according to the below:

1. Meaning and Memory
2. Dissonance
3. Media Studies
4. C4D and Social Change
The analysis chapter is structured into four headings: Meaning and Memory, Place of Pain and Shame-Dissonance, Media studies, C4D and Social Change. The author discusses the results in a manner conforming with RQ1 and compares them with the literature review. By using this structure, the reader can get a better grasp of the analysis results. According to Bell and Bryman (2022) a thematic analysis, a qualitative data analysis technique that concentrates on identifying patterns, was selected to categorize and interpret the data.

Besides, Braun and Clarke (2006) state that thematic analysis consists of six phases to recognize and differentiate the appropriate themes from the empirical data. First, to get familiar with the data collected and read it to have an overview of the content. Second, to generate codes for the data gathered to make it easier to understand and organize. Third, to search for themes and organize it according to its similarities, and to prepare it for the analysis. Fourth, to review the themes already sorted to ensure their relevance to the research question as well as to the aim of the study. Fifth, to define and name the themes to identify their importance and the material’s basis. Last, to produce the report to present the findings of the themes and to develop a comprehensible and relevant statement of the data gathered to answer the study’s purpose and research question.

4.3. Research Validity and Reliability

In order to do interviews that generate results that are both valid and reliable, the below points need to be taken into consideration:

**Internal validity:** It enquires whether the questions posed can explain the outcome to be researched (causal association between variables) (Yin, 2003). In this paper, questions about the dissonance of heritage have been asked; giving the author the possibility to research the different layers of periods at the “heritage” site.

**External validity:** It refers to the extent in which the results can be generalized (Yin, 2003). The interview questions used in data collection to be revised by Degree Project supervisor and respondents, who provide feedback to increase the external validity of the study. Thus, increasing the extent to which the interview findings can be generalized to other contexts and individuals.

**Reliability:** It describes how far a particular test, procedure or tool, such as a questionnaire, will produce similar results in different circumstances, assuming nothing else has changed (Roberts
and Priest. 2006). To reduce errors in the study, a folder was created on Jemaa el-fna square to keep the results reliability named Jemaa el-fna square Documentation (Appendix).

**Scientific Approach: Positivism and Hermeneutics**

According to Andersson (1979) positivism suggests that theory and method are regarded independently, and that the method tests theory. Indeed, Andersson (1979) states that methods are viewed as procedures required to assess what extent theories reflect or match the external reality and theories are viewed as direct depictions of empirical phenomena. Hence, positivism needs to offer researchers with valid and reliable information that is both neutral and objective. Similarly, according to Denscombe (2017), positivism is an approach to social research that seeks to apply the natural science model of research to investigations of social phenomena and explanations of the social world.

Welch et al., (2011) says that hermeneutic, known as interpretive approach, is a part of the epistemological consideration concerning how knowledge is analyzed, allows us to interpret and understand human behavior in social context. This description depicts the subjective nature of the research approach. Actually, Wallén (1996) states that interpretations can take different forms including symbols or conventions that deliver understanding of the message regardless of misinterpretation or disturbance. In short, this study focuses on investigating and examining the dissonance of heritage at Jemaa el-fna square employing qualitative methods to gather data from the respondents. Therefore, the scientific approach can be viewed as Hermeneutic.

**4.4. Implications and Ethics**

A range of ethical issues that have been raised about the use of interviews in social science work, whether to do with the need for informed consent, and how or whether this can be achieved, or with the invasion of privacy, or the requirements of reciprocity (Hammersley, 2014). Indeed, respondents need to be informed about the character and objective of the research and how the information will be used prior to data collection. Also, securing anonymity and confidentiality of the respondents should be of high importance.
Rosenblatt (1995) suggests that there is no single ‘trustworthy ethical formula’ that can be applied to a qualitative research interview; ethical guidelines are co-constructed as the interview progresses. Hence, the author aims to reflect continuously as responding to the respondents’ needs and interests. In the same vein, Brinkmann and Kvale (2005) state that it is important to inform the respondents of their right to withdraw at any time. Thus, preventing unpleasant outcomes for the respondents, and to consider the researcher’s role. But it is also important to consider how the knowledge produced will circulate in the wider culture and affect humans and society (Brinkmann and Kvale, 2005).

One of the main themes to emerge from this research is that of boundaries: the boundaries associated with being a professional researcher (including the development of rapport, the use of researcher self-disclosure and the need for support and debriefing) (Allmark et al., 2009). In the same context, Rosenblatt (1995) suggests that researchers should avoid therapeutic intervention. Similarly, Smith (1992) states that the researcher interviewer’s role is not a cathartic one. The author is aware of boundary management that can be caused due the openness and intimacy of the interview situation and strive to maintain professionalism while interviewing. Also, emphasizing that the researcher-respondent interaction is not quasi-therapeutic relationship (Brinkmann, 2008).

Data need to be stored safely and securely to ensure conformity with the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR). In fact, being informed about how the respondents’ data is used via a detailed ‘privacy notice’ covering prescribed topics (Wessels, 2022). And gathering the respondents’ consent prior to the interview emphasizes the legal requirement for data to stay private, hence the author reassures the respondents and underpins professionalism. Last, the respondents are notified that guaranteeing total confidentiality may not be feasible, yet the author seeks to prevent any breach of privacy. Any information that can identify the respondent is left out such as names. Also, it will be highlighted to the respondents that once the DP (degree project) is finalized it will be submitted to Malmö University and stored in the university’s archives.
Empirical Findings and Analysis

Layers of Periods at the Site

According to Akhchine (2022) Jemaa el-fna square was a Place of Justice (figure 2), to carry out acts of justice. It has a site-specific element; where outlaws are executed conforming Harrison (2012) statement about heritage: keeping the past present.

Figure 2: Jemaa el-fna (1934) (Lucky Find, 2022)

Later, it became a Place of Communication; where El Berah (a messenger between the authorities and the people) shared social, and spiritual information. As stated by Smith (2006) heritage as an act of communication and meaning making. After, the site became a Place of Business (figure 3) that contains shops, souks (markets) and the customs (Akhchine, 2022).
Last, Jemaa el-fna square became a **Place of Celebration** that offers traditional food, storytelling (Halca) (figure 4), music (Gnawa) (figure 5) and carriage riding (figure 6). Hence, cultural heritage is being produced in intangible form as music and storytelling. Which conforms with Smith (2006, p.2) ‘‘...Heritage not so much as a ‘‘thing’’ but a social and cultural process’’. Also, heritage is a creative engagement with the past in the present; to take an active role in the production of our own ‘tomorrow’ (Harrison, 2012). To illustrate, Mohamed El Joundi, Actor and Narrator (Start Next, 2013), describes storytelling as ‘‘Through tales, we become educated. We learn how to behave. We love to learn. Through tales, we can choose the life we want to live. We can dream; to be a doctor, an engineer, an inventor. Tales make life likeable. ‘‘ (Akhchine, 2022).
According to Akhchine (2022) one used to think of heritage as objects, but it is about communication. It is about the engagement and the passing on. And through the process, the identity of oneself, one’s community is transferred. It is meaning making; that makes it alive. In short, these layers of history are in disharmony; they belong to people with different value systems.

As stated by Harrison (2012) ‘‘a set of values and experiences we wish to take into the future’’. Besides, heritage is attributed; ascribed to a site, object, or place - rather than belonging intrinsically (Smith 2006, p.3).
Meaning and Memory

Jemaa el-fna is the central square of Marrakech. It is the most important place in the Medina (old city) where the public life of the city takes place, day, and night. During the day, many things will catch your eye. You will find monkey trainers, snake charmers, as well as dentists displaying their latest extractions. And during the night, as soon as night falls, Jemaa el-fna square changes its atmosphere completely. All the stalls, the shops, and the businesses of the morning will disappear to make way for the evening food stalls, musicians and improvised shows. As a matter of fact, Jemaa el-fna square has different stories, interpretations, and meanings. This was evident from varied responses in interviews. The voices presented are not implied to be representative ones. However, they show a sequence of significant reflections from informed and engaged respondents. What follows are short synopses of every respondent:

“Childhood memories, especially in the summer, as well as a meeting place for professionals and friends.”. R 5

“Jemaa el-fna square represents life before death. All life manifestations are there: Joy, happiness, noise, cries, and arguments. It is a web of life”. R 9

“Jemaa el-fna means to me: travel in history/in the past, crowd, noise, traditional music, smell of food, games, storytelling, and also some aspects of poverty of the Moroccan society”. R11

In this sense, heritage is storied in site and is a global tourism icon. Yet, there is enigma to it; it means different things to different people (figure 7). As the inputs one gets depends on the cultural background, age, seniority level, career field, personal views, and the site interaction. As a way of illustration, Respondent 11, a retiree at WHO (World Health Organization) touches upon poverty in the Moroccan society. Which is reasonable since the respondent had worked in an organization that aims to build a better and healthier future for people worldwide. Another example is Respondent 9, a retiree at police station who studied criminology interprets Jemaa el-fna square as
“life before death”. Also, it seems logical as the respondent was exposed to death and trauma during his years of service in Morocco and Europe. Last example is Respondent 5 who is originally from Marrakech- the birthplace of Jemaa el-fna square, associates the site with childhood, summer vacation, and meeting friends. Which makes sense, given that the respondent spent years in Marrakech and has a social network. Which confirms Freud theory of memory; the archaic past, is intrinsically connected with infancy (Nikulin ,2015).

![Figure 7: Meanings of Jemaa el-fna Square](image)

**Memorable Experiences**

A visit to Jemaa el-fna Square, it is a dream come true for the most beautiful square in Morocco. During the day, one can admire the snake charmers, the monkey trainers, and coachees. Afterwards, drink a squeezed fruit juice and listen to the tales of storytellers (Halqa) that are bristling with history. In the evening, to attend beautiful musical shows before indulging in a bistro
and taste delicious dishes of traditional Moroccan cuisine such as Couscous, Tagine, Harira, Bastilla…etc. Below are how the respondents remember Jemaa el-fna square:

“I would say that Jemaa el-fna square reminds me of a lot of childhood memories. We had a routine, every week, every Saturday, we went to see my grandmother who lives elsewhere, just next to the Medina. At the end of the day, we left on foot with my cousins, my aunts. We went as a family and had a great time. What we did after that; become insignificant. For me, Jemaa el-fna is an emblematic and popular place in Marrakech, which attracts the number of tourists from all over the world every year”. R 2

“I remember Jemaa el-fna, the multitude of street artists, dried fruit stalls and freshly squeezed orange juice before our eyes, we waited for the evening to enjoy the dozens of musical and artistic events that occur there. At nightfall, a colorful crowd converges on Jemaa el-fna to taste the coolness of the evening while attending family shows”. R 3

“We used to think of it as a popular museum in Marrakech”. R 7

“Jemaa el-fna might have changed over time as there are more activities for entertainment for instance, but the spirt of the place has not changed. There we have somehow the feeling that we are back to another ancient and familiar, even if we have not known it. We also have the feeling that time has stopped for a while and that we are not in the actual modern world”. R 11
Capturing the past or recollection of events is a main activity of the human mind. As a matter of fact, it underwrites our identities as individuals and our connection to people, objects, and places. These memories can take various attributes as shown in figure 8.

First, personal, an enactment of daily routine, and come from everyday life as mentioned by Halbwachs (1992). This was evident in Respondent 3; who described Jemaa el-fna as a personal experienced event using, facts, meanings, and past feelings. Besides, memory ‘‘collectively shared knowledge’’ is collective and gives groups a sense of unity and heritage as confirmed by Assmann.
Which was described by Respondent 2 who has a collective memory of the site Jemaa el-fna square with the family, depicting unity as a value of the Moroccan family. In this case, collective memory refers to values of a social group. In addition, remembering and “Past continuity in the Present”. How memories help to establish the infinite present as it was mentioned by various researchers Pierre Nora (1989), Jan Assmann (2011), Hansen (2008), Garde-Hansen (2011) and Erll (2009). This was illustrated by Respondent 11 “Time has stopped for a while”. In other words, the respondent was living the past in the present. Further, memory as “Lieux de memoire” (Nora, 1989), as a form of memorialization. This was stated by Respondent 7, whose memory of Jemaa el-fna square is associated with “Museum”. I.e., the site has historical importance that it has become a symbolic element of the heritage of the city (museum).

**Memory Keeping and Heritage Preservation**

The act of remembrance is important to keep or bring in mind memories related to a place. As it was proposed in the concept “lieux de memoire” or sites of memory by Pierre Nora (1989). Hence, memory keeping is one way to preserve heritage. As a way of illustration, ‘Keep it as it is’ and ‘Keep its memory’ (figure 9), nations can preserve memory of the past like with monuments. As it was stated by Respondent 11 “Keeping this place as it is; a way for civilizations to preserve memory of the past (e.g., museums)”. In other words, to gain knowledge about the past, how things got done, looked like and how they were in various timelines and sites. Yet, Respondent 10 highlighted tolerance to keep the cultural heritage “To keep this multi-cultural diversity and tolerant spirit”. Along the same lines, “Respect it and its people” Respondent 6. To show cultural respect; recognize other cultures, and traditions of different groups of people. Thus, heritage preservation is about how people use the place.

The maintenance and management of heritage ‘keep it with care’ (figure 9) has been touched upon by Respondent 12 “It cannot be denied that the place Jemaa el-fna despite its role in the preservation of memory it still lacks a reinforcement of maintenance and organization”. Correspondingly Respondent 4 “The preservation of heritage begins with the restoration, enhancement and preservation of the touch of history of this place, Jamaa el-fna, remains an example to be promoted to give value to the site and other historical heritage”. Which supports the mission of the World Heritage Convention; safeguarding and preserving cultural heritage that has notable value (UNESCO, 2023a). On the same note, “To safeguard Jemaa el-fna square, the
government should increase security measures, educate locals and tourists, implement environmental and traffic regulations, and involve the community” Respondent 1. Highlighting the involvement and participation of the local population and the creation of public awareness thorough education to preserve the heritage site. Henceforth, maintenance and management, referring to the ongoing care aid in the long-term preservation of the cultural heritage. In brief, “The world's documentary heritage belongs to all, should be fully preserved and protected for all and, with due recognition of cultural mores and practicalities, should be permanently accessible to all without hindrance” (UNESCO, 2023c).

Figure 9: Heritage Preservation
**Place of Pain and Shame - Dissonance**

Looking back on history, the heritage place Jemaa el-fna square had a troubling part. Based on the respondents’ answers related to the dissonance of Jemaa el-fna two main categories were formed: Aware and Unaware; in the Aware group two sub-categories were established: Advocates and Critics. An overview of the respondents’ comments is shown in figure 10.

Most of the respondents (9 out of 12) were Aware that Jemaa el-fna square was a Place of Pain and Shame, using terms as executing rebels, opposing the Sultan, ordering justice, applying sentences, and legal proceedings (figure 10). Which falls under Logan and Reeves (2009) description of dissonant heritage. Besides, many of the respondents advocated the use of Jemaa el-fna square as a place of justice. In other words, legal punishment to deter outlaws and as a mean to control misconduct without producing more of it in the process. Which gives a glimpse about the history of punishment and the associated culture. As stated by Respondent 1 “I think the use of Jemaa el-fna square as a court of law is a significant testament to the square's cultural legacy and its role in Morocco's history”. Relatedly, Respondent 5 “Like many historical monuments all over the world, the square has a history and a function which may be the reason for its construction”.

On this note, dissonance is an example of conformity ‘Everyone else is doing it’ as illustrated by Respondent 12 “Every nation has a mythical symbol in its history. For example, the Place de la Bastille in Paris, site of the French Revolution of 1789. And the Statue of Liberty in United States”.

Public executions are a troubling part of Moroccan history. Indeed, punishments for crime have long come in various forms. It is a violation of human rights, the fundamental right of life, and a burden of shame. Nonetheless, attitudes regarding certain legal punishments altered in modern society, and many countries have abolished the death penalty entirely. Plus, UN experts and activists are calling for a universal abolition of the death penalty. As indicated by Respondent 11 “I read in history books that Jemaa el-fna was a Place of Justice where public capital punishments took place. This was a common practice in many countries in similar places till early 19th century. Today I would say that this is not an appropriate practice in view of human rights principles and rules” Conforming Logan and Reeves (2009) “… these sites bring shame upon us now for the cruelty and futility of the events that occurred within them and the ideologies they represented”.

Hence, dissonant heritage is a heritage which causes pain or remember past incidents not easy to be reconciled with people’ principles and everyday interactions.
Figure 10: Dissonance- Aware Vs Unaware
Heritage Transformation- Celebration

The usage of the heritage site Jemaa el-fna square has evolved over time, which supports Assmann (2011) argument “On the basis of its cultural heritage and traditions, a society is recognizable: for itself as well as for others. What kind of past and what identification values a society shows to good advantage indicate its character and in which direction it wants to be heading”. This was illustrated by Respondent 5 “The role of Jemaa el-fna square changes according to need and history and as long as the law has changed in Morocco and also the organizations, we have automatically changed the role of the square”. Also, Respondent 4 “It is a normal progression in the history of countries, the sultans who succeeded one another took to renew and give another meaning to this place”.

As noted above, Jemaa el-fna square initial role was a place of pain and shame where executions were held; that is likely to surprise visitors. Which raises the question on why? How and what do societies remember?

“Jemaa el-fna square become a Place of Celebration, where cultural events, festivals, and performances take place throughout the year. This transformation is due to various factors, including the growth of tourism in the city and the continued importance of the square as a cultural hub”. R 1

“It is a place of celebration and joy, it is a pleasant place where one can live the present time and the past time, because one sees ancestral traditions there. Without forgetting that the Marrakech International Film Festival takes place on the Jemaa el-fna square, giving this magnificent place a universal influence”. R 9

“Because it is a place where the smells, the colors, the senses of Moroccan daily life come together. You can find musicians, singers, vendors, and snake charmers here, as well as many food stalls that offer traditional Moroccan dishes. The square is especially lively in the evening, when dozens of food stalls set up and people flock to eat, drink, socialize and enjoy the square's unique atmosphere. That's why it has become a place of celebration and socializing”. R 2
One possible answer, this site is remembered as a place of entertainment and social life as stated by many of the respondents. To illustrate this, problematic pasts do not all bear upon the present, and contemporary identity-making, in the same kinds of ways (Macdonald, 2010). Some places of pain and shame have come to be regarded with the passage of time often as reminders of the bitter stages of a society’s evolution, and warnings of the potential inhumane actions (Logan and Reeves, 2009) (Respondent 11). In these instances, there can be little or no debate about their heritage meaning. Moreover, the pain and shame can be lost in the celebration of other, more commercial, values at sites that have become major tourist attractions (Logan and Reeves, 2009). As illustrated by Respondent 9 “Marrakesh International Film Festival takes place on Jemaa el-fna square”.

The Holocaust is another example of heritage site that has changed usage and meaning. Many organizations, monuments, and museums have become memorials to the Holocaust such as: Memorial to the Murdered Jews of Europe in Berlin, The train station in Pithiviers, France, Auschwitz Camp Complex in Poland, United States Holocaust Memorial Museum in Washington, and The Hall of Names at Yad Vashem, Jerusalem. The latter houses the extensive collection of “Pages of Testimony” – short biographies of each Holocaust victim. Over two million Pages are stored in the circular repository around the outer edge of the Hall, with room for six million in all (Yadvashem, 2024). In these sites, historical events are taught for locals, tourists, and schools, they are dedicated to educate people about the Holocaust. Besides, the sites are visited by people with or without personal connection. Hence, the memorials serve to remember or celebrate; to remember past events and to celebrate Jewish resistance to the Nazi party and commemorate the victims for generations to come.

A further possible answer has to do with the ways in which knowledge about the past is utilized as a reference of orientation for both the present and the future. I.e., collective memory indicates a joint body of knowledge. In line with this thinking, Heritage is not history (Lowenthal, 1998), but a celebration. The latter often aimed at utilizing our past, or our perceived past at least, for our own present-day purposes. The transformative development of Jemaa el-fna square has regained the site from its association with dissonance, and in turn facilitated a less prevalent perception of remembering the executions ‘moving beyond dissonant memories of the past’ and contributing to the Moroccan culture. Also stated by Respondents 4, 5, and 11. Which supports Assmann (2011) Cultural Memory Model about the dynamic interactions between remembering
and forgetting. The continuous process of forgetting is part of social normality. As with the human mind, also in the communication of society, some information needs to be forgotten to make space for new information. I.e., forgetting some memories to make new memories. In addition, though the Internet has changed the way information is stored and revitalized, the merits of forgetting still stand and people will continue to move beyond their pasts (Assmann, 2011).

To conclude, dissonant heritage is not only what is interpreted, but how it is interpreted and by whom, will create quite specific messages about the value and the meaning of specific heritage places and the past they represent (Tunbridge and Ashworth, 1996). Community can create a solid connection with its cultural heritage even when dissonance is observed, and the memory is argued. Locals such as Respondents 4, 9, and 11 consider the site part of their cultural identity and they are interested in sharing their memories with visitors. Jemaa el-fna was a place of pain and shame, yet with time it has become a place that offers vibrant social life with a UNESCO intangible cultural heritage listing.

Jemaa el-fna square has gained international recognition over the years. One reason, through media. Hence, there is every interest for the authorities to preserve and modernize it. I.e., keeping the character of the site, keeping its oral, musical, and spiritual traditions.

“Because the community, the vendors, traders, and tourists are very involved, and they have a very significant impact on this. They are strong enough, to the point that the authorities cannot change the character of the site” Respondent 2. The ways in which heritage transformation, reconstruction and destruction can be problematic for communities unless the communities themselves actively decide on – and engage with – these processes, from a bottom-up perspective (Apaydin, 2020). Besides, “Being registered as World Heritage, this is far from being a state project, that said, no risk” Respondent 4. Indeed, it is difficult to make disappear a mythical heritage which existed for centuries. Furthermore, “The authorities want to keep the ambience of Jemaa el-fna without changing anything in its tradition” Respondent 10. In short, the heritage place possesses social value ‘entertainment’, which is important for the society. It is why government regulations and international measures can preserve places of community and cultural significance.

Considered as artistic heritage of Morocco, the place continues to benefit from great interest from major world cultural bodies, such as UNESCO, which has erected it as Intangible Cultural Heritage.
of Humanity (UNESCO, 2022). The globalization of Jemaa el-fna culture is a favorable asset for the city and the country, because for many tourists, the country is known through the mythical Jemaa el-fna square. As stated by Respondent 4 “Tourists do not know Morocco but know Marrakech well thanks to Jemaa el-fna”. As a matter of fact, “The media coverage of Jemaa el-fna square has played a significant role in promoting the cultural heritage of Morocco and increasing tourism to the area” Respondent 1. This is in line with Marshall McLuhan (1994) who argue that media are extensions of memory. How media can be utilized to communicate histories, and cultural heritage. Besides, “The media coverage of the square has made this unique place known throughout the world. Jemaa el-fna square is a city” Respondent 2. Which supports Eck (2013) “As the world becomes increasingly “smaller” through the use of communications media, the opportunities to better understand the archaeology of cultures, become markedly improved”. Hence, due to media the developed world can have a better understanding of the developing world’s culture.

“I would say that the square has been publicized over the years, notably thanks to reports, television programs, documentaries which have presented the square as one of the most fascinating and lively places in the city. I think this media coverage also contributed to the massive influx of tourists to the square, which may have had an impact on the authenticity and the traditional atmosphere of the square” Respondent 8. Indeed, the role of media awareness is important to raise citizens interest in cultural heritage and involve them in taking responsibility for the protection of cultural heritage (Darwish, 2019). Simultaneously, educating, informing, entertaining and engaging the public. Moreover, “The media coverage has aroused the interest of public figures e.g. Juan Goytisolo who won Miguel de Cervantes prize, the Spanish-language Nobel, he wished to create a home for abandoned children who live in the surroundings of Jemaa el-fna”. Respondent 9.

C4D and Social Change

Economic and Social Impact

Cultural heritage has economic and social benefits. Below are some of the respondents’ statements.

“It helps you get immediately immersed in the Moroccan culture and helps you enjoy the best parts of it”. R 6
Jemaa el-fna square is an emblematic place in the city of Marrakech. It is a gathering place for locals and tourists, and it contributes significantly to the economic, cultural, and social development of the city. It is an important commercial center for the city; many traders and street vendors sell a wide variety of goods such as souvenirs, clothes, jewelry, food, and many other products. Thus, generating income for traders and creating jobs for the inhabitants themselves (Respondent 7). Besides, Jemaa el-fna square is also an important cultural place (Respondent 6). Street artists such as musicians, singers and dancers perform in the square and attract many spectators, which automatically preserves the cultural richness of the city of Marrakech and strengthens the cultural identity of the city. As argued by Solomon, Adu-Debrah, and Braimah (2022) “As a performing narrative, storytelling is an effective communication strategy in cultural and heritage tourism”.

Cultural heritage has social impacts. The latter can be illustrated in the example of storytelling, whether factual or fictional. Through storytelling people can understand and relate to the world. Humans need stories, as they can teach us many lessons such as collaboration, compassion, and equality. Indeed, it is a tool of communication to establish positive social norms and values, hence foster social change. Besides, “Stories” are produced, reproduced, and even evolved in various media. Especially, how we communicate with each other, “tell stories” has altered radically over the years. Which was mentioned by Respondent 1 “My grandparents used to tell me about the story of the storytellers: Jemaa el-fna square has a long tradition of storytelling, with professional storytellers known as "halaiqi" setting up shop in the square to share their tales with the public.
These storytellers would often draw large crowds of listeners, and their tales would range from fables and myths to historical accounts and political commentary.”

In short, the art of storytelling is important because it entertains educates and transmit cultural traditions and values to the next generations. As it was emphasized by Brown (2005) “the significance of intangible cultural heritage is not the cultural manifestation itself but the knowledge that is communicated through it from one generation to the other.

**Future of Jemaa el-fna**

When asking the respondents about the future of Jemaa el-fna, digitalization of cultural heritage and the use of new media were highlighted in the preservation and promotion of the site, such as museums, exhibitions, solar panels, ecological irrigation systems. Also, “it’s there to stay” Respondent 8 conforming “Past continuity in the Present” highlighted by the different scholars Pierre Nora (1989), Jan Assmann (2011), Hansen (2008), Garde-Hansen (2011) and Erll (2009).

Below are some of the respondents’ statements:

“For more better economic income the change might happen, for example a museum might be built and all the scenes taking place in the place might be recorded and projected there for the visitors” R11.

“Jemaa el-fna square can be developed in an innovative way by offering new services: installation of modern technology structures such as solar panels, ecological irrigation systems to improve the energy efficiency and sustainability of the square”. R 2

“May be and due to the growing impact of the virtual world, the artificial intelligence will change the meaning of tourism in the minds of future generations”. R 1

“The organization of cultural events, conferences, exhibitions in order to preserve traditions at risk of disappearance” R 9.
To sum up, Jemaa el-fna square plays an important role in the urban context of Marrakech. It is the place of exchange between two present and ancient worlds. And, in recent years, several associations have been born with the aim of preserving the place. One can say that Marrakech without Jemaa el-fna is like Paris without the Eiffel Tower. Nevertheless, the heritage site is at risk of certain issues. “Some residents of the city of Marrakech have also expressed concerns about the square being over-commercialized and losing its authentic character” Respondent 12. On a similar note, urbanization can be a threat to cultural heritage due to the inevitable growth and transformation of the urban area. Eventually, putting pressure on city liveability. As demonstrated by Respondent 9 “The establishment of urban laws to protect Jemaa el-fna from financial, land and real estate speculations. For instance, property in sale in Jemaa el-fna costs 15000-20000 euro per square meter”. Also, “The cultural practices may suffer acculturation, also caused by widespread tourism”. Respondent 10

New Theoretical/Conceptual Framework

According to the study findings, a new Theoretical/Conceptual Framework (figure 11) is developed by adding Identity. The passage from memory to history has required every social group to rede-fine its identity through the revitalization of its own history. The task of remembering makes everyone his own historian (Nikulin, 2015). Memory has a significant role in identity formation and establishment of self. According to Respondent 9, “Jemaa el-fna square represents the existence of different identities in Morocco (Arab, Berber, Ghinnawa) which makes Morocco”. I.e., by preserving memory of the site, one preserves the various identities of the country. Hence, memory is a resource for the identity and unity of communities as described by Respondent 11. “The world is changing constantly as well as the use of public space and today Jemaa el-fna is part of, or is rather the identity of Marrakech, and of course this benefits tourism and to the economy of Morocco”.

“I think it is there to stay, and I hope that it’s heritage will be preserved”. R 8
5. Conclusion

A visit to Jemaa el-fna has brought back memorable experiences in the respondents. First, personal, an enactment of daily routine, and come from everyday life as mentioned by Halbwachs (1992). Next, “Past continuity in the Present” as mentioned by Pierre Nora (1989), Jan Assmann (2011), Hansen (2008), Garde-Hansen (2011) and Erll (2009). Moreover, “Lieux de memoire” (Nora, 1989), which was stated by Respondent 7, whose memory of Jemaa el-fna square is associated with ‘Museum’. In fact, Cultural heritage can have various meanings and interpretations. It means different things to different people. Which was illustrated by the respondents depending on their background, career fields, seniority level, site interaction and personal views.

Memory keeping is one way to preserve cultural heritage. Other ways include, maintenance and management (keep it with care), performance (keep it alive), cultural respect (respect it), identity (keep it as it is) as shown in figure 9. As a result, by preserving cultural heritage, societies can keep their identity as indicated in the new Theoretical/Conceptual framework (figure 11). The study also highlighted the importance of international measures such as UNESCO World Heritage Convention to preserve heritage sites of community and cultural significance. Besides, media
either traditional or the new media to promote, preserve the cultural heritage and create public awareness.

Heritage represents the collective memory of people. These memories help societies to understand their past, their ancestry, and make sense of their history. Plus, to pass on knowledge and culture to next generations. As it was emphasized by Brown (2005) “the significance of intangible cultural heritage is not the cultural manifestation itself but the knowledge that is communicated through it from one generation to the other. How storytellers (Halaqi) would tell and share their tales for live audiences in various ways. In fact, these performers aid people to change perspective on the world around them and reassess their environment. Not to mention, transmit knowledge, values, and traditions to coming generations.

Heritage dissonance is the identification of the heritage site as a ‘’Place’’ of pain and shame. During the process of remembrance and forgetting (Assmann, 2011), the dissonant heritage can be transformed to adapt to the changes in today’s world. It has become over time a place of celebration. Thus, instead of witnessing public execution. People smile now, dance, and eat. People smile while listening to Halqa's jokes, to the songs of the different musical troupes. And enjoy the different flavored dishes.

Jemaa el-fna has a significant impact on the lives of the people. For years, the square has been a place of gathering, commerce, entertainment, and a cultural hub for the locals, the tourists, the region and for the world. Today, the square continues to play an important role in the daily life of its inhabitants generating income, creating job opportunities, boosting the economy through tourism hence improving the quality of life. Yet, its influence extends far beyond the city itself. Consequently, issues such as urbanization, over commercialization, and acculturation, can threaten the cultural heritage.

**Research Question**: how to bring together different layers of heritage, interpretations, and meanings, which become memorial?

- The site is remembered as a place of entertainment and social life. reminders of the bitter stages of a society’s evolution, and warnings of the potential inhumane actions (Logan and Reeves, 2009).
The pain and shame can be lost in the celebration of other, more commercial, values at sites that have become major tourist attractions (Logan and Reeves, 2009).

The ways in which knowledge about the past is utilized as a reference of orientation for both the present and the future (Assmann, 2011).

Forgetting some memories to make new memories. Assmann (2011) Cultural Memory Model about the dynamic interactions between remembering and forgetting.

**The Resurrection of Jemaa el-fna**

The earthquake that struck the city of Marrakech and its surroundings caused more than 2862 deaths and 7,000 injuries (New York Times, 2023), all Moroccans mobilized massively to come to the aid of the victims, demonstrating an enormous surge of citizen solidarity. Donations of money or blood, collection of food, medicine, tents, and clothing, knowing that this earthquake caused the destruction of more than 50,000 homes (New York Times, 2023). Fortunately, the city of Marrakech, including Jemaa el-fna square, was not seriously affected, just some material damage. But concerns remained following persistent aftershocks.

The role of the State to resurrect the city of Marrakech and Jemaa el-fna square are also notable. Despite the earthquake, no hotel closed in Marrakech, only a few riads (guest houses) for restoration. We can say that Marrakech is safe to revive tourism after the earthquake. Indeed, an online campaign was initiated to promote tourism at Jemaa el-fna Square, under the hashtag "MARRAKECH IS SAFE". Also, international events were held in Marrakech, such as the Annual Meetings of the IMF and the World Bank, as well as the Marrakech International Film Festival. To conclude, the role of the State and people in the resurrection of Marrakech have been crucial.

(13148 words)
References


Blatter, J. K., 2008. Case Study. In L. M. Given. (Eds.), The SAGE Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods. SAGE. http://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781412963909.n39

Brinkmann, S., 2008. Interviewing. In L. M. Given. (Eds.), The SAGE Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods. SAGE. http://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781412963909.n239


Akhchine (2022), CCMA (Culture and Media Analysis) essay, Jemaa el-fna Square Marrakech, Morocco.


Accessed 25 April 2023


Harrison, R., 2010. What is heritage. *Understanding the politics of heritage*, pp.5-42.


Lucky Find (2023), Photo vintage la place Jemaa el Fna 1934 Marrakech. Available at: https://www.luckyfind.fr/annonces/054887-photo-vintage-la-place-jemaa-el-fna-1934-marrakech
Accessed 02 April 2023


Marrakech Tricks (2023), 7 Amazing Historical Facts about Jemaa el Fna. Available at: https://marrakechtricks.com/blog/jemaa-el-fna-history
Accessed 02 April 2023

MasterClass (2021), Dissonance in Music Explained: Consonance vs. Dissonance. Available at: https://www.masterclass.com/articles/dissonance-music-explained#6da6r5GpeIrBfm1GwqSaou
Accessed 23 April 2023


National Geographic (2021), Here’s how World Heritage status helps destinations around the world. Available at: https://www.nationalgeographic.com/travel/article/here-is-how-world-heritage-status-helps-destinations-around-the-world
Accessed 28 April 2023

National Geographic (2023), Storytelling and Cultural Traditions. Available at:

Accessed 26 April 2023

**New York Times (2023),** *Earthquake in Morocco Death Toll Rises to 2,862 as Help Begins to Reach Hardest Hit Areas.* Available at: https://www.nytimes.com/live/2023/09/11/world/earthquake-morocco-marrakesh


**Storynet (2023),** *What is Storytelling?* Available at: https://storynet.org/what-is-storytelling/

Accessed 26 April 2023


**UIS (2009),** *Cultural Heritage.* Available at: https://uis.unesco.org/en/glossary-term/cultural-heritage

**UNESCO (2021),** *Intangible Heritage: Arts And Traditions Of The World.* Available at: https://www.unesco.org/archives/multimedia/subject/13/Intangible+heritage
Accessed 27 December 2022

UNESCO (2023a), *World Heritage*. Available at: https://whc.unesco.org/en/about/#:~:text=UNESCO%27s%20World%20Heritage%20mission%20is%20to.%20Encourage%20countries,List%3B%20Encourage%20States%20Parties%20to%20establish%20management%20
Accessed 24 April 2023

UNESCO (2023b), *World Heritage List*. Available at: https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/
Accessed 02 May 2023

Accessed 04 May 2023

Yadvashem (2024). *Hall of Names in the Yad Vashem Holocaust History Museum*. Available at: https://www.yadvashem.org/museum/holocaust-history-museum/hall-of-names.html
Accessed 17 January 2024

Appendices

Appendix I

The Dissonance of Heritage

Jemaa el-fna Square Marrakech, Morocco

Interview Questions

Position:

Meaning and Memory

1. What does Jemaa el-fna square mean to you?
2. How do you remember Jemaa el-fna square growing up? Stories from your grandparents?
3. Is Jemaa el-fna the best instrument to preserve memory?

Dissonance

4. Do you know that Jemaa el-fna was a Place of Justice?
5. What do you think about that?
6. Today Jemaa el-fna is a Place of Celebration. How come?

Media Studies

7. Is there a risk that the authorities can change the character of the site and destroy its oral, musical, and spiritual traditions?
8. How to safeguard Jemaa el-fna square?
9. What do you think about the media coverage of Jemaa el-fna square?

C4D and Social Change

10. How Jemaa el-fna contributes to the development of the city/community/country?
11. How Jemaa el-fna has changed the lives of people?
12. What is the future of Jemaa el-fna square?
Appendix II

La Dissonance du Patrimoine

Place Jemaa el-fna Marrakech, Maroc

Antécédents du répondant

Poste:

Sens et mémoire

1. Que représente pour vous la place Jemaa el-fna?
2. Comment vous souvenez-vous de la place Jemaa el-fna en grandissant? Des histoires de vos grands-parents?
3. La place Jemaa el-fna est-elle le meilleur instrument pour préserver la mémoire?

Dissonance

4. Savez-vous que Jemaa el-fna était une place de justice (châtiment des hors-la-loi et execution)?
5. Qu'en pensez-vous?
6. Aujourd'hui, Jemaa el-fna est un lieu de fête. Comment ça?

Etudes des Medias

7. Existe-t-il un risque que les autorités modifient le caractère du site et détruisent ses traditions orales, musicales et spirituelles?
8. Comment sauvegarder la place Jemaa el-fna?
9. Que pensez-vous de la médiatisation de la place Jemaa el-fna?

Communication pour le Développement et le Changement Social

10. Comment Jemaa el-fna contribue au développement de la ville/communauté/pays?
11. Comment Jemaa el-fna a changé la vie des gens?
12. Quel est l'avenir de la place Jemaa el-fna?
Appendix III

World Heritage Convention (UNESCO, 2023a)

- Encourage States Parties to establish management plans and set up reporting systems on the state of conservation of their World Heritage sites.
- Help States Parties safeguard World Heritage properties by providing technical assistance and professional training.
- Encourage participation of the local population in the preservation of their cultural and natural heritage.
- Encourage international cooperation in the conservation of our world's cultural and natural heritage.